



REPRESENTATION OF MINORITIES IN THE NEW MEDIA

ANALYSIS OF PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISTIC STANDARDS IN NEW MEDIA PRACTICES

The report is based on the findings from the monitoring project that analyzed underlying features of journalistic coverage of minority issues within the most prominent news websites from four Balkan countries: Bulgaria, Croatia, Greece and Macedonia. It gives comparative insight of professional standards in the new media practices within the period June-July 2015.

REPRESENTATION OF MINORITIES IN THE NEW MEDIA

ANALYSIS OF PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISTIC STANDARDS IN
NEW MEDIA PRACTICES

TABLE OF CONTENTS

About the monitoring.....	
I. Research Design.....	
II. Summary of research findings	
1. FORMAT OF THE ARTICLE.....	
Headline	
Section of the website	
Type of article	
Salience of the visual and textual part	
Visuals.....	
Focus of the item on minority issue	
Authorization of the item.....	
Hyperlinks and comments.....	
2. TOPIC SELECTION	
Topic of the item	
Type of minority in question	
Minority identification	
Minority voice(s) relation with majority/mainstream voices.....	
3. ACTORS IN THE STORY	
Actor's social role:	
Actor's contribution in the presentation of the event.....	
Actor's gender	
Generalization of actor' activity	
Actor's voice	
Major attributes	
Framing of the story	
III. Conclusions	

Author:

Marko Troshanovski

Skopje, 2016

Appendixes	21
Tables	21
Codebook.....	22

ABOUT THE MONITORING

This research on representation of minorities in the new media is part of the project “You(th) Challenging Diversity: Representation of Minorities in the New Media” implemented by Mladi info International and the partner organizations: Europe for Diversity, Culture, Coexistence and Citizenship, Media Development Center and Mladiinfo Croatia.

The research aim was to detect and portray the underlying features of journalistic coverage regarding minority issues within the new media public sphere in four Balkan countries: Bulgaria, Croatia, Greece and Macedonia. It gives general and comparative insight of professional standards in the new media practices. Also, it provides a glimpse into the framing and priming in online discourses created by new media articles on minorities.

The research was focused on monitoring of news websites representative for each participating country within the period June-July 2015. Each article that tackled upon minority issue was analyzed through the method of content analysis. The research instruments were tailored to new media content and format and partially customized with reference to the instructions in Media Monitoring Manual by Snjezana Milivojevic, Media Diversity Institute, London 2003.

We monitored the following news media web sites:

Bulgaria

- offnews.bg
- blitz.bg
- dnevnik.bg
- topnovini.bg

Croatia

- Index.hr
- Net.hr

- Tportal.hr
- h-alter.org

Greece

- Iefimerida.gr
- Newsbomb.gr
- In.gr
- Tvxs.gr

Macedonia

- Kurir.mk

- A1on.mk
- Almakos.com

Acknowledgments:

I would like to thank the monitors who devotedly worked throughout the mid summer – early autumn period of 2015 and produced excellent monitoring data bases. The credits go to Asen Velichkov and Gergana Kutseva from the Media Development Center (Bulgaria), Sanja Cerlenica, Ana Zuzic and Tamara Miletic (Mladi info Croatia), Ana Alibegova and Shemsedin Iljaz (Mladi info International, Macedonia) and Eglantina Kumaraku from Europe for Diversity and Eleni Petropoulou (Greece)

I. RESEARCH DESIGN

The theoretical approach of this research relies on the framework of the Cultivation analysis theory (G. Gerbner and L. Gross) and Agenda Setting theory (McCombs and Donald Shaw). On one side media actively construct the reality they are reporting on, through selection of topics, providing context for interpretation (framing) and emphasizing and/or omitting certain attributes of media information to convey meaning (priming). On the other, media create common outlook of the world through constant exposure of the audience to same images and labels (mainstreaming). Consequently, they reinforce our perceptions, stereotypes and prejudices (resonances). Their responsibility in construction of our reality and our concepts of other and otherness is crucial and therefore media practices ought to be constantly monitored and evaluated with final aim to create accurate and realistic images of non-dominant groups to which we belong or that are around us.

While there was little commercial and political interest in reporting on minorities in the past, contemporary media coverage inevitably encompasses minority issues in its agenda as minority visibility and public`s sensibility for minorities inhabit modern diverse societies. Moreover, the audience behavior is shifting from traditional to new media, and usage of news website as information source is continually increasing. Therefore in order to understand public attitudes towards minorities in our societies it is useful to focus on news media articles as an object of analysis.

The research aim was to detect the underlying practices and distinctive features in new media treatment of minorities in the region. The objective was to analyze the format of the news articles (how the story is told) and the meaning they convey to the audiences (what`s the story about). For the former we monitored journalistic standards and practices that produce (un)fair treatment and (in)tolerance towards minorities. For the latter we analyzed values, labels, perceptions and topic selection. With this monitoring we tried to

answer how much minority issues are part of the new media agenda, what is the comparative quality of coverage in the region, what are the common and specific elements of coverage and what are the stereotypes and prejudices that are conveyed through the new media.

For this purpose we focused on three to four web sites representative for each country. The main criteria of selection were: Firstly, it must be a news web site exclusively online (i.e. not website version of traditional TV or newspaper outlet) and have considerable frequency of news articles during the research period between 1 June and 1 August 2015. Secondly, criteria was that the web site should be influential (models public perceptions and public agenda) and popular (it is highly ranked by the indexing site Alexa.com).

The unit of analysis was every particular individual text with certain qualities and quantities that touched upon minority issue. As a definition of minority we took the broadest understanding and included ethnic, sexual (LGBT), gender minorities, migrants and refugees, asylum seekers, people with disabilities and trafficking victims. The articles' length, format, genre, placement etc. were not criterions for selection ¹.

The research instrument for the new media content analysis comprised the following categories: identification of the articles, format of article, topics selection and framing of the actors and overall assessment of the articles.

The intercoder reliability achieved in the test phase was .82.

¹Milivojevic S. (2003) Media monitoring manual, Media Diversity institute, London, pg.26).

II. SUMMARY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS

An important context that influenced the findings from this research project was the refugee/migrant crises in Europe during the summer 2015. Particularly, the participating countries were strongly affected by the escalating waves of migrants and refugees that culminated during the research period. These occurrences inevitably shaped media attention and the units of analysis (the articles), on the account of representation share of other types of minorities targeted with this research. Consequently, there is a reasonable skewness in the research findings although qualitative insight into journalistic practice regarding other minorities (different than refugee/migrant segment) is conclusive and indicative.

During the research period total % of 960 articles were analyzed. Their underlining traits and differences specific for each participating country and for the region in general are elaborated in this summary. In Bulgaria we monitored 318 articles, (33% of the total amount), Croatia 201 articles (20.9% of the total amount), Greece with 140 articles (14.6% of the total amount) and the Macedonian case study encompassed 301 articles or 31.4% of the total.

	Frequency	Percent
Bulgaria	318	33.1
Croatia	201	20.9
Greece	140	14.6
Macedonia	301	31.4
Total	960	100.0

Table1. Distribution of articles per country

Source (website)	Frequency	Percent	
Macedonia	kurir.mk	78	8.1
	a1on.mk	179	18.6
	almakos.com	44	4.6
Bulgaria	offnews.bg	69	7.2
	blitz.bg	97	10.1
	dnevnik.bg	54	5.6
	topnovini.bg	98	10.2
Croatia	index.hr	79	8.2
	net.hr	42	4.4
	tportal.hr	70	7.3
Greece	h-alter.org	10	1.0
	iefimerida.gr	39	4.1

newsbomb.gr	70	7.3
tvxs.gr	31	3.2
Total	960	100.0

Table 2. Distribution of articles per source/country

The research findings are elaborated and structured in three main dimensions: format of the article, topic selection and actors in the story. Each dimension is further divided in categories. Within a particular category findings for the entire region are reported as well as specifically for each country.

1. FORMAT OF THE ARTICLE

This dimension shows the structure of journalistic coverage. Specific formatting features of an article are indicative for the approach that media have in telling stories. Headline connection to the body of the text (whether it summarizes the story or is irrelevant to it), headline content (whether it is sensationalistic or informative), position of the article within the web page, visual content etc. they all provide assumptions and create preconditions for good and bad journalistic practices in portraying minorities.

HEADLINE

In significant majority of the cases introduction of the story in the article is relevant to the content. The headlines reflect the essence of the story fairly and are rarely unrelated.

Q4. Headline	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Related (relevant) to the article content (story)	97.2	95	97.5	96.4	99.7
Not directly related (irrelevant) to the article content (story)	2.8	5	2.5	3.6	0.3
Total %	100.0				

On regional level most of the articles headlines are descriptive and informative without using sensationalistic headlines. Croatia and Macedonia have the highest number of descriptive /informative articles, whereas in the case of Bulgaria sensationalistic headlines slightly prevail in 54% of the cases.

Q5. Headline type	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Sensationalistic	31.1	54.1	11.4	30.7	19.6

Descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic	68.9	45.5	88.6	69.3	80.4
No headline	0.4	0.4			
Total %	100.0				

SECTION OF THE WEBSITE

32.7% of the articles are on the home page of the websites which shows that minority related issues has been given significant relevance by the website's editorial staff. This arouses readers' curiosity and interest, promotes this discourse to a significant extent. Macedonian web sites in most of the cases gave big attention to the minority issues on the front page or placed them in internal affairs context, while in the case of Croatia minorities are treated in the section for foreign affairs mainly regarding national minorities from the neighboring countries. Bulgaria and Greece are also treating minorities in social context and as well as on their home pages. There is insignificant number of articles in the sections for culture and sport which usually provide affirmative context for minorities, but also placement in political context is rare which contributes to marginalization of minority narratives specifically in the political debate.

Q6. Section of the website	Total				
	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Front page	32.7%	31.3%	11.6%	28.5%	43.5%
Foreign affairs pages	14.1%	4.8%	52.6%	27.8%	3.2%
Political pages	1.8%	3.9%	.9%	2.8%	.2%
Society pages	11.9%	27.9%	.9%	21.5%	.0%
Culture	.4%	.4%	.9%	1.4%	0.0%
Criminality pages	5.7%	14.3%	1.9%	5.6%	0.0%
Sports	.4%	.4%	.0%	0.0%	0.7%
Supplement	.8%	.2%	.0%	2.1%	1.3%
Internal affairs Domestic page	21.0%	11.2%	26.0%	9.7%	30.5%
Other	11.0%	5.6%	5.1%	.7%	20.6%
Total	100.0%				

TYPE OF ARTICLE

Most of the articles are news stories and this is evident both region wise and for each country. News websites tend to cover minority issues in informative genres and avoid to include them in editorials. They also rarely post letters from readers, columns or commentaries. Aside other countries only Bulgaria gives some "feature article" perspective. This indicates that news media are more prone to write or report about minority stories deriving from daily events, rather than going into analysis, background story,

reportages, interview or investigative article that enable more comprehensive insight into a minority topic. There is also a strong tendency in using “ready made” texts by the news agencies or as in case of Macedonia just posting press releases from public institutions (Ministry of interior or Ministry of labor and social policy).

Q7. Type of article / item	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
News story	87.2	82.3	92.5	89.9	88.7
Brief	4.2	5.4	3.5	2.9	4.0
Feature article	4.1	8.9	1.5	.7	2.3
Editorial	.6	2.5	0.5	.7	.3
Letter/ Column/ Commentary	2.9	.9	2.0	4.3	3.3
Other:	1.0			1.4	1.3
Total %	100.0				

SALIENCE OF THE VISUAL AND TEXTUAL PART

The length of text and the visuals devoted to a certain topic is indicative for the editorial policy of the site, but also for how much space and by this importance is given to it. While in the case of Greece mainly very short paragraphs are used, Bulgaria and Macedonia give similar proportion of space to articles (ranging from text on the entire page or longer to half page text). Croatian news website evidently prefer to post extensive news stories.

Q8.Salience of the textual part	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Very long item more then 1800 characters	28.5	24.4	46.3	2.9	33.3
Long item up to 1800 characters	32.2	33.9	48.3	5.8	32.0
Medium item up to 900 characters	22.4	30.7	5.0	14.5	29.3
Short item up to 450 characters	8.8	10.1	.5	23.9	4.7
Very short item up to 200 characters	8.1	.9	0.0	52.9	.7
Total %	100.0				

Articles in Macedonia and Greece give biggest (in terms of salience) visual context. While Greece predominantly uses videos aside texts to illustrate minority issues, other countries stick to single photograph visuals. Most of the visuals in the articles focus on visual representation of the minority as group/crowd rather than individual, which further enhanced generalization and stereotypization of minorities in journalistic practices.

Q8a. Salience of the visuals	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Dominant visual context	9.3	6.9	1.0	21.0	12.0

Big visual context	31.3	22.0	3.0	34.1	59.3
Moderate visual context	36.5	36.2	52.7	37.7	25.0
Visual context	20.6	33.0	39.8	1.4	3.7
Small visual context	2.4	1.9	3.5	5.8	0.0
Total %	100.0				

VISUALS

Q11. Visual presentation type	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Single Photograph	74.9%	86.5%	81.7%	17.3%	82.4%
Illustration - sketch, drawing, comics	.6%	.3%	.5%	1.4%	1.2%
Graphics - data, tables, graphs, maps	.3%	0	.5%	3.6%	0
Item supported with video article	7.0%	6.3%	4.1%	71.9%	11.0%
Item supported with audio article	.3%	.9%	0	.7%	0.0%
Gallery	15.7%	5.7%	12.4%	0.0%	4.8%
Live broadcast, chat	.1%	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
None	.4%	0	.9%	2.9%	0.0%
Other	.8%	.3%	0	2.2%	.6%
	100.0%				

Q12. Visual presentation - content	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Individual (minority)	14.7%	18.9%	10.5%	14.6%	12.7%
Crowd - Group	54.1%	41.6%	52.9%	74.5%	59.8%
Object	14.9%	23.9%	10.5%	1.5%	13.9%
Other	16.2%	15.6%	26.2%	8.8%	13.3%
None				.7%	0.3%
	100.0%				

In the context of the story, the overall message about a specific minority conveyed by the images is descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic. Greece has the highest number of articles with sensationalistic context, whereas 93% of the Croatian articles are informative and descriptive. There is not significant number of images that trivialize the story when positioned nearby. Moreover there are no jokes, cartoon or satire illustrations that use humor, irony, exaggeration or mockery to downgrade certain minority.

Q13. Visual context	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Sensationalistic	20.6	23.7	5.5	30.7	22.7
Descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic	77.6	74.7	93.0	67.1	76.6
Other	1.7	1.6	1.5	2.1	.7
Total %	100.0				

As the research analyzed all articles that tackle upon certain minority, it is important to know the focus that an article gives in this sense. The findings show that great majority of articles in all countries had major focus (extensively elaborated) on minority issue or an actor. In these cases more than half of the article's content, quantitatively and in terms of importance was devoted to the minority in question. Minorities are almost never mentioned on the margins of a story. 20.8% of the articles from Bulgaria though, combine minority related aspects with other issues.

FOCUS OF THE ITEM ON MINORITY ISSUE

	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Main focus of the item	83.4	76.7	83.5	86.9	90.6
Secondary focus of the item	13.2	20.8	13.5	10.9	6.0
Just related to the main focus	3.3	2.5	3.0	2.2	3.3
Total	100.0				

An underlying feature of the news web site articles is that almost half of them on regional level are not signed nor attributed in any way. In the worst cases, significant majority of articles in Macedonia 83.6 % and Greece 56.9% are unattributed. Croatia is exemption in the region, but in this case most of the articles (59%) are taken from news agencies and republished.

AUTHORIZATION OF THE ITEM

Q10.Authorization of the item	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Author signed with full name and surname	13.8	25.2	13.5	13.1	2.3
Author signed with initials	3.6	0.0	13.0	0	1.3
Taken from other source	7.2	3.8	12.0	6.6	8.0
News agency	26.9	29.6	59.0	23.4	4.7
Not signed	48.5	41.4	2.5	56.9	83.6
Total %	100.0				

HYPERLINKS AND COMMENTS

In terms of content analysis of traditional versus new media other important distinction is the nonlinear structure of the narrative in the online articles. This non linearity is achieved by the comment section and hyperlinks that provide the reader with different related and relevant contexts which mustn't be ignored during the monitoring process. Although they

are secondary to the overall message of a certain article, the content from the hyperlinks can shape reader`s attitudes. They are also a good example of new media journalist practice. Unfortunately, the regional online news coverage predominantly mimics traditional media news formats and doesn't include hyperlinks. With exception of Greece where more the half of the articles include descriptive and informative hyperlink, the other countries have no hyperlinks available in their articles.

Q14. Hyperlinks available	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Sensationalistic	6.1	5.4	0	21.9	1.3
Descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic	12.6	7.6	5.5	58.4	2.3
No hyperlinks available	81.3	87.0	94.5	19.7	96.3
Total %	100.0				

Regarding the comments section of the news articles where readers are invited to share their views on the topic in question more the half of the articles have no comment section available. This percent per country is biggest among Macedonia websites (98.7%) and in Greece (83%), while Bulgaria has 45% of cases where comments by readers are mainly discriminatory. This negatively affects the minority in question, especially if this sections are not moderated. In this case inappropriate verbal disqualification, hate speech, discrimination etc. are dominating and significantly contribute to the overall message that the news article conveys.

Q15. Comments/context	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Comments are mainly discriminatory	21.9	45.0	28.5	5.2	.7
Comments are mainly descriptive, informative	10.0	18.6	9.5	11.1	.7
Comments are mainly irrelevant	10.2	10.1	32.0	.7	0.0
No comments	57.9	26.4	30.0	83.0	98.7
Total %	100.0				

2. TOPIC SELECTION

The second dimension of the research was focused on media agenda and the framing process that organizes or structures message meaning. The categories within this dimension show in what context minorities are mentioned, how are they portrayed and what attributes are given to a certain minority group.

TOPIC OF THE ITEM

In terms of overall topic or theme, articles regard minority policies make 55.3% of the regional new media coverage of minorities. There is a deficit of feature articles that have minority- perspective in every day issues such as social programs, budget planning or cultural policy. These stories are deprived of diverse angles, such as how budget cuttings affect people with disability or what is the positive implication of a certain majority community activity on the majority community. Hence, articles do not treat policies that are initiated or derive from the needs or interest of marginalized groups but put emphasis on the policies that are implemented on them by state institutions. Macedonia and Croatia have the most articles within this theme. Conflict are theme of coverage in only 14% of the cases, where Greece has the most articles. Everyday life of minorities is mostly covered by Bulgarian news web sites.

Q16. Topic of the item	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Conflict	14.1%	19.7%	2.7%	34.1%	8.1%
Minority policy	55.3%	32.0%	65.8%	57.8%	70.4%
Everyday life	30.6%	48.3%	31.6%	8.1%	21.5%
	100.0%				

a. Conflict

When it comes to the theme of conflict, minorities are put in a context of conflict-related activities - i.e. activities that are not related to the actual violent confrontation such as harassing of population, police actions, robberies, criminal activities, illegal immigration etc. Bulgarian articles reports mainly in this direction on Roma and migrants. Greece reports the most on serious violent conflict of certain duration such as illegal immigrants or refugee presence in the Greek society. Macedonian news website on the other side are focused on lasting non-violent disputes such as non-violent inter-ethnic and social tensions. Croatian coverage of minorities is predominantly focused on minority incidents but as individual occurrences, exceptional events or criminal activities that might involve violence but are not part of continuous confrontation (such as irredentism claims, civic protest clashes). Media seldom put minorities in conflict solving context - i.e. negotiation, cease fire, peace initiatives. Journalistic investigations into previous conflicts (official investigations about victims, fact revealing activities, trails, commemorations, etc.) are not part of the regional new media reporting hence more objective, comprehensive representation of minorities is negatively affected. (See table Q16a in the Appendix).

b. Minority policy

This is the most covered theme in the regional coverage of minorities (55% of all cases) monitored. News web sites most frequently write about state responses to a certain minority issue. Themes of interest here are migrant/refugee crises political initiatives regarding minority policy issue, new legal proposals, political and policy measures, their consequences, criticism or debates. However, Minority civic-political representatives advocating minority rights are fairly represented with 22.3%. The regional perspective regarding minority issues is present through coverage of reaction of the international community (EU, UNHCR and similar institutions). News on migrant and refugee crises dominates the articles that threat neighborhood context. In this regard Greek news website give poor coverage of the regional problems and context, rather focusing on domestic problems with migration and the reactions of EU towards it, while Croatian give most attention from all countries to minority right in neighboring context, mainly Italian speaking minorities in Istria region. On the other side Greece is giving the most space to voices of civic society or political representatives advocating minority issues. In this case coverage of state reaction or policy measures are somehow underrepresented. This disables the public to create informed attitudes regard the official position and actions of the state towards minorities. (See appendix Table Q17)

c. Everyday life

Articles talking about minorities within the theme of Everyday life are represented in one third of the cases in regional perspective. News predominantly talk about minority then the topic is crime or incident. Greece and Bulgaria have most significant majority of articles within this frame where mainly portrayed as actors in criminal activities or incidents (Roma minority in case of Bulgaria and migrants in case of Greece) which further enhances the negative stereotypes for this minorities. Examples of positive portraying are most present in Croatian coverage especially regarding Cultural activity - i.e. education, customs, rituals, tradition etc. Croatian website also provide general background stories and historical context with stories about the past, historical cases of discrimination, or cooperation. Macedonia gives the most attention (in affirmative perspective) of political, business, and social activities of its dominant Albanian ethnic minority - i.e. inclusion of minority in the activities of the mainstream society. (See Appendix Table Q18).

TYPE OF MINORITY IN QUESTION

The overall findings for this category shows that migrant, refugees and asylum seekers dominate the media agenda. The representation of these types of minorities in the regional

coverage amount to 61.2% with main focus on migrants arriving in Europe from the crisis regions through the so called “Balkan transit route”. Trafficking victims, LGBT community, people with disabilities remain marginalized in the new media agenda. From this minority types, the most space is given to LGBT community in Croatia mainly regarding human rights rallies or anti LGBT protest. Croatia, Greece and Macedonia are focused on migrants in most of the cases while Bulgarian articles treat ethnic minorities the most, mainly Roma. In summary, refugee/migrant crisis in the region occupied the media agenda, however it is evident that other minority types remained omitted in the reporting.

Q19. Type of minority in question	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Ethnic minorities	23.2%	55.8%	7.6%	3.9%	8.9%
Migrants	32.3%	11.0%	33.5%	57.9%	42.7%
Refugee	18.9%	14.8%	21.3%	24.3%	19.1%
Asylum seekers	11.0%	6.1%	10.3%	3.9%	18.9%
Trafficking victims	2.0%	2.0%	1.1%	2.6%	2.2%
LGBT	8.0%	5.6%	21.3%	3.9%	3.2%
People with disabilities.	3.4%	3.8%	2.3%	2.0%	4.2%
Minority in general	.9%	.8%	1.5%	.7%	.7%
Minority issue	.3%	0.0%	1.1%	.7%	0.0%
	100.0%				

MINORITY IDENTIFICATION

Most frequently used words for identifying a certain minority were politically correct and didn't not conveyed any discriminatory meaning. As noted before, most represented are refugees, asylum seekers, migrants and immigrants from Syria. Also an underlying feature of the journalistic coverage in the region is the frequently inconsistent and inappropriate use of the words “migrant”, “immigrant” and “refugee” frequently followed by the denotation “illegal”. In some cases in Bulgaria, members of the Roma minority are pejoratively identified as “Gypsies”. Aside this example other minority types are correctly identified with proper use of terminology. The semantic cloud below is created by excerpts from all monitored articles in which minorities were somehow defined. It illustrates the overall narrative regarding the minority coverage during the research period by proportional visualization of words according to their frequency in the texts.



Semantic cloud from the entire data base of article excerpts where minorities are identifies.

MINORITY VOICE(S) RELATION WITH MAJORITY/MAINSTREAM VOICES

To understand the focus and the angle of a news story it is important to see if a minority voice is involved in it. The monitoring analyzed to which extent the protagonists' points of view are reported by the journalists, in order to provide readers with a comprehensive and objective perspective on the matter. Thus, detecting whose voices and standpoints are heard in the story, whose viewpoint predominates (minority or majority ones) is meaningful. If there is reasonable balance of viewpoints presented by a minority's representatives and by others it is fair to expect that the article is informative and objective.

The overall results from the monitoring show that minority viewpoint is predominately not reported with exemption of Greece where 77.6% of the articles report the voice of the minority in question through representatives. In this case there is a professional balance between minority and majority standpoints which is a good journalistic practice. However, cross tabulation of results show that those articles that do report minority voice, convey minorities' perspective more dominantly and lack the other side perspective. This is the case with Macedonian articles that report on Albanian ethnic minority or Croatian articles talking about Italian speaking Croatian minorities. In the other countries significant majority of articles do not include sources representing minorities in question.

The results in this category shows high frequency of minority blind articles. The overall characteristic of the media reporting in this sense is that articles have disbalance between

minorities and the majority group (therefore, a lack of diversity) in sources, resulting in limited perspectives on an issue.

Q21, Voice of the minority reported:	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
YES	11.3	16.8	13.1	3.0	8.2
NO	69.0	74.4	68.8	19.4	86.3
Through representative(s)	19.6	8.9	18.1	77.6	5.5
Total %	100.0				

Q22. Minority voice(s) relation with majority/mainstream voices	Valid Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Minority voice balanced	47.4	33.7	27.4	86.0	12.6
Minority voice dominates	39.6	44.6	61.3	7.5	4.4
Minority voice is insignificant	11.3	21.7	11.3	2.8	53.6
Minority voice is absent.	1.7	0	0	3.7	29.4
Total	100.0				

3. ACTORS IN THE STORY

The third dimension of our research subject is about the individuals, groups or collectivities that are in focus. Analyzing the social or professional roles that are attributed to them depicts the generalization of roles common or inherent to a certain minority group. Additionally, articles and comments in which an insulting language is used against a minority group, provoke verbal and physical violence, stigmatization and discrimination in political and social life. The monitoring focuses on several types of stereotypes: Obvious stereotypes: Articles or images in which a minority group is presented in stereotypical roles, carrying stereotypical faults/duties; terminology that degrades a minority group, banalising its achievements and glorify or justify violence against it. - Subtle stereotypes: Articles or images that reinforce notions of a minority's characteristics/roles/faults in ways that make this seem normal. Finally, the overall framing of the article, the selecting, omitting and/or emphasizing different content segments produces underlying emotional, intellectual and behavioral reactions of the readership.

ACTOR'S SOCIAL ROLE:

This category focused on the actors in the story, both defined and defining ones. The combination of the social roles attribution and the defining/defined minority aspect tell us that minorities are mainly defined as a collectivity by the power holders and decision makers. As most of the articles were about minority policies, actors who define them most frequently represent politics, or state institutions and international organization. Consequently, most social roles attributed to the definers of the minority are the ones of politicians or state officials. It is evident that minority's social roles as experts or in the field of entertainment, art, sport and culture are very rare. Hence, analytical and informative insight in minority discourse is disabled. Also affirmative stories of success, portraying minorities as "role models" or mainstreaming their social statuses are absent from the overall picture.

Q23. Actor's social role:	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Vox populi, man-woman on the street	6.0%	9.3%	7.0%	1.5%	6.1%
Minority rights activist	9.1%	9.3%	19.3%	8.3%	7.2%
Politician	10.8%	10.4%	17.0%	13.5%	3.5%
State official	11.7%	19.3%	11.6%	5.3%	2.7%
Expert	3.0%	3.9%	3.1%	1.5%	1.9%
Artist	.9%	1.5%	.3%	1.5%	.3%
Celebrity / show buzz	.7%	.7%	1.0%	.8%	.3%
Criminal	3.0%	6.7%	.3%	4.5%	.3%
Sportsman/ women	.5%	.2%			1.3%
Witness	3.5%	5.9%	.5%	3.0%	3.2%
Collectivity, write:	27.8%	11.7%	18.3%	21.8%	55.1%
Undefined	11.1%	17.2%	15.2%	.8%	1.1%
Other	12.0%	3.7%	6.4%	37.6%	17.1%
	100.0%				

ACTOR'S CONTRIBUTION IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EVENT

On the other side, the defined minority that is the object of the narration is mainly treated as collectivity. Results show that in 45,6% of the cases minorities are the defined actor and in this aspect Macedonian articles contribute the most with 87% . Greece has the biggest percentage of articles in which minorities are both defining and being defining while voice of the minority is presented most frequently in the Croatian articles.

Q26. Actor's contribution in the presentation of the event	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Defining actor	25.7%	36.8%	46.2%	3.8%	6.8%
Defined actor	45.6%	30.5%	28.8%	20.6%	86.0%
Both defining and being defined	28.7%	32.7%	24.2%	75.6%	7.2%

ACTOR'S GENDER

As the majority of articles that defined their actors as collectivity or institutional representatives, defining the gender of actors was not applicable. However, in rest of the cases there is clear gender disbalance in favor of the male perspective on the story. This is typical for all countries included in the research except for Macedonia.

Q24. Actor's gender	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Male	33.7%	49.7%	47.3%	21.4%	10.4%
Female	12.0%	18.7%	14.3%	5.3%	2.6%
Other	54.3%	31.6%	38.4%	73.3%	87.0%
	100.0%				

GENERALIZATION OF ACTOR' ACTIVITY

The research focused on whether the angle of the story sets general frame for interpreting certain minority actions, features or issues. Tendencies for stereotypization through generalization are evident in this category. In most of the cases minorities are reported as representatives of a larger group (Macedonian ethnic Albanians) or as whole group in general (for example all refugees). However, discrimination on the basis of minority generally belonging to a social group differentiated from the social majority, is mainly absent.

Generalization of actor\\	Valid Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
As an individual case	17.6	23.1	18.1	12.2	13.7
As representative of a larger group	48.7	36.1	51.3	47.3	60.8
As typical for the whole minority group	32.5	39.2	28.0	39.7	25.3
As typical for minorities in general	1.3	1.6	2.6	.8	.3
Total	100.0				

ACTOR'S VOICE

Actor voice in most of the cases is either directly quoted or referred to but not quoted. Journalist tend not to paraphrase minority sources. 29.4% of the articles in Macedonia didn't referred to nor paraphrased the voice of the minority in question. The same goes for more than a third of the articles from Bulgaria.

Q27. Actor's voice	Valid Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Directly quoted	39.7	47.8	57.9	52.7	12.6
Paraphrased	10.4	9.8	24.1	4.6	4.4
Referred to but not quoted	35.6	31.3	12.3	42.7	53.6
Other:	14.2	11.1	6.6		29.4
Total	100.0				

MAJOR ATTRIBUTES

Another aspect in the coverage of minority issues was about the way actor's activities were described. This was done with aim to assess how minorities are qualified and to eventually identify stereotype or metaphor used to "explain" actor's behavior. This will show to which extent certain, for example, criminal behaviors are ascribed to an entire group and described as specific of that group's way of life. The overall finding is that the terminology was often reporting and evaluative, but rarely vulgar. Frequently news media tended to emphasize the nationality or ethnicity of news stories' protagonists. The coverage on activities of migrants and refugees from the crises region is diagnostic, empathetic and informative with occasional focus on violent outbreaks or potential negative implications on social stability and employment. Negative attributes are given to Roma population where their activities are contextualized in higher crime rates, but this is not an underlying feature. Activities of other minorities are neutrally presented.

FRAMING OF THE STORY

Finally, the monitoring assessed the general approach to the topic expressed in an item. In other words the underpinning feature of the media coverage in terms of media selectivity, placement, focus, choice of rhetoric and presentation. This overall assessment of the coders about authors approach to the minority in the story showed that most of the stories

were diagnostic and evaluative –interpretative. However, considering the findings from other categories this is true in sense that the journalist tried to elaborate the context for certain minority behavior, but they did it through sources that were not minority itself, but representatives of state institutions, politicians, official state announcements and other non-minority definers. They did not prefer assumptions, but didn't write diverse, multiangle stories either. Hence, journalist's evaluation and interpretation were mainly one sided, without mobilization messages or discriminatory rhetoric's.

29. Framing of the story	Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Diagnostic	60.4%	60.1%	48.0%	39.0%	78.2%
Prognostic (prefer assumptions to the direct testimony of the people involved in news stories)	2.4%	1.6%	1.6%	9.6%	1.2%
Evaluative - interpretative	21.1%	22.1%	32.0%	30.9%	8.1%
Mobilization	8.6%	7.3%	11.5%	11.8%	6.7%
Discriminatory	7.5%	8.9%	5.3%	2.9%	5.9%
100.0%					

III. CONCLUSIONS

The key research finding regarding the representation of minorities in the new media is that through politically correct vocabulary, they predominantly write about migrants and refugees and are neglecting other types of minorities. On one side, voices of minorities as sources in the news articles, are underrepresented and on the other, they (the minorities) are mainly defined by state officials or political representatives of the majority. In this light more voice should be given to minorities in the articles through interviews and feature articles that are currently quite rare. Also increased use of hyperlinks, videos and moderated commentary section is something that should be most frequently part of the structure of the news articles. The dependency on the “ready made news” from the news agencies should be decreased.

In significant majority of the cases introduction of the story in the article is relevant to the content. The headlines reflect the essence of the story fairly and are rarely unrelated. On regional level most of the articles headlines are descriptive and informative without using sensationalistic headlines.

Most of the articles are news stories and this is evident both region wise and for each country. News websites tend to cover minority issues in informative genres and avoid to include them in editorials.

News media are more prone to write or report about minority stories deriving from daily events, rather than going into analysis, background story, reportages, interview or investigative article that enable more comprehensive insight into a minority topic. There is also a strong tendency in using “ready made” texts from news agency or official press releases from state institutions .

Most of the visuals in the articles focus on visual representation of the minority as group/crowd rather than individual, which further enhanced generalization and stereotypization of minorities in journalistic practices. There is not significant number of images that trivialize the story when positioned nearby. Moreover there are no jokes, cartoon or satire illustrations that use humor, irony, exaggeration or mockery to downgrade certain minority

In the context of the story, the overall message about a specific minority conveyed by the images is descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic.

The findings show that great majority of articles in all countries had major focus (extensively elaborated) on minority issue or an actor. In these cases more than half of the article`s content, quantitatively and in terms of importance was devoted to the minority in question.

An underlying feature of the news web site articles is that almost half of them on regional level are not signed nor attributed in any way.

The regional online news coverage predominantly mimics traditional media news formats and doesn't include hyperlinks.

In terms of overall topic or theme, articles regard minority policies make most of the regional new media coverage of minorities. They do not treat policies that are initiated or derive from the needs or interest of marginalized groups, but put emphasis on the policies that are implemented on them by state institutions. They most frequently write about state responses to a certain minority issue. Themes of interest here are migrant/refugee crises political initiatives regarding minority policy issue, new legal proposals, political and policy measures, their consequences, criticism or debates). News on migrant and refugee crises dominates the articles that threat neighborhood context.

The overall findings for this category shows that migrant, refugees and asylum seekers dominate the media agenda. Trafficking victims, LGBT community, people with disabilities remain marginalized in the new media agenda

Most frequently used words for identifying a certain minority are politically correct and didn't not conveyed any discriminatory meaning. However, an underlying feature of the journalistic coverage in the region is the frequently inconsistent and inappropriate use of the words "migrant", "immigrant" and "refugee" frequently followed by the denotation "illegal. The overall finding is that the terminology was often reporting and evaluative, but rarely vulgar. Frequently news media tended to emphasize the nationality or ethnicity of news stories' protagonists. The coverage on activities of migrants and refugees from the crises region is diagnostic, empathetic and informative with occasional focus on violent outbreaks or potential negative implications on social stability and employment.

APPENDIXES

TABLES

Q16a Topic of the item conflict	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Violent conflict - i.e. serious violent conflict of certain duration, not an individual incident	10.5	0.0	0	30.4	3.8
Conflict-related activities - i.e. activities that are not related to the actual violent confrontation but are working towards sustaining that confrontation (arming of troops, harassing of population, police actions, rebel activities etc.).	31.5	23.1	0	43.5	38.5
Conflict solving activities - i.e. negotiation, cease fire, peace initiatives.	3.5	7.7	0	0	0.0
Truth and reconciliation activities - i.e. investigations into the truth about previous conflicts (official investigations about victims, fact revealing activities, trails, commemorations, etc	4.2	6.2	0	4.3	0.0
Lasting non-violent disputes - i.e. non-violent political, economic, social etc. conflicts.	14.0	12.3	0	4.3	38.5
Minority incidents - i.e. individual occurrences, exceptional events, criminal activities that might involve violence but are not part of continuous confrontation	27.3	32.3	83.3	17.4	19.2
Other:	9.1		16.7		
Total	100.0				

Q17. Topic of the item: minority policy	Total %	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Government minority policy - i.e. general political initiatives regarding minority policy, new legal proposals, policy measures, their consequences, criticism, debate etc.	41.1	44.6	39.9	17.9	48.7
Minority civic-political representatives –advocating minority rights	15.4	10.9	14.2	23.1	15.2
International community – on minorities	22.3	17.8	14.9	52.6	18.8
Minority policies - in the neighborhood -region	19.6	23.8	30.4	6.4	17.4
Other:	1.6	3	.7		
Total %	100.0				

Q18. Topic of the item: every day life	Valid Percent	Bulgaria	Croatia	Greece	Macedonia
Exceptional achievement - i.e. "positive example" stories, individual positive examples within negative context.	8.4	6.4	8.5	18.2	11.6
Political, business, and social activities of the minority - i.e. inclusion of minority in the activities of the mainstream society	11.0	10.2	1.4	18.2	21.7
Cultural activity - i.e. education, customs, rituals, tradition etc.	13.0	13.4	19.7		7.2
Criminal - Incidents activity.	45.1	59.2	25.4	63.6	30.4
General background stories, history - i.e. stories about the past, historical cases of discrimination, or cooperation, general background analysis	7.1	3.8	18.3		4.3
Other:	15.3	7	26.8		24.6
Total %	100.0				

CODEBOOK

REPRESENTATION OF MINORITIES IN NEW MEDIA

COODEBOOK

Appendix 1 Minority's coverage coding sheet

I. FORMAT OF THE ARTICLE

1. Country/article ID

1. Bulgaria

2. Croatia
3. Greece
4. Macedonia

1. 1 Article link: http://: _____

2. Date-month (when the article was posted)

3. Websites codes

(TO BE ADDED ADITIONALLY)

1.

4. Headline

1. Related (relevant) to the article content (story)
2. Not directly related (irrelevant) to the article content (story)
3. No headline
9. Other:

5. Headline type

1. Sensationalistic/Discriminatory
2. Descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic
3. No headline
9. Other:

6. Section of the website

- | | | |
|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------------|
| 1. Front page/Home | 5. Society pages | 9. Supplement |
| 2. Foreign pages | 6. Culture | 10. Internal affairs/
Domestic page |
| 3. Political pages | 7. Criminality pages | 11. Other: |
| 4. Economy pages | 8. Sports | |

7. Type of article / item

1. News story
2. Brief
3. Feature article
4. Editorial
5. Letter/ Column/ Commentary
9. Other:

8. Salience of the item

1. Very long item
2. Long item
3. Medium item
4. Short item
5. Very short item

8a. Salience of the visuals

1. Dominant visuals context
2. Big visual context
3. Moderate visual context
4. Visual context
5. Small visual context
6. No visuals

9. Focus of the item on minority issue/actor

1. Main focus of the item
2. Secondary focus of the item
3. Just related to the main focus

10. Authorization of the item

1. Author signed with full name and surname
2. Author signed with initials
3. Signed with pseudonym
4. Taken from other source
5. News agency
6. Not signed

11. Visual presentation - type

1. Single Photograph
2. Illustration - sketch, drawing, comics
3. Graphics - data, tables, graphs, maps
4. Animation
5. Item supported with video article
6. Item supported with audio article
7. Gallery
8. Live broadcast, chat etc.
9. None

10. Other:

12. Visual presentation - content

1. Individual (minority)
2. Crowd/ Group
3. Object
4. None
9. Other:

13. Visual context

1. Sensationalistic/Discriminatory
2. Descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic
9. Other

14. Hyperlinks available

1. Sensationalistic/Discriminatory
2. Descriptive, informative, non-sensationalistic
3. No hyperlinks available

15. Comments on item/article

1. Comments are not allowed
2. Every comment is allowed
3. Discriminatory/negative comments are filtered

15.1 Comments context/content (only if every comment is allowed)

1. Comments are mainly discriminatory
2. Comments are mainly descriptive, informative
3. Comments are mainly irrelevant
4. No comments

II. ABOUT THE ITEM/ARTICLE

16. Topic of the item>

1. Conflict
2. Minority policy
3. Everyday life

16a. Topic of the item: conflict

1. Violent conflict - i.e. serious violent conflict of certain duration, not an individual incident (Macedonia).
2. Conflict/crime-related activities - i.e. activities that are not related to the actual violent confrontation but are working towards sustaining that confrontation (arming of troops, harassing of population, police actions, rebel activities etc.).
3. Conflict solving activities - i.e. negotiation, cease fire, peace initiatives.
4. Truth and reconciliation activities - i.e. investigations into the truth about previous conflicts (official investigation about victims, fact revealing activities, trails, commemorations, etc.).
5. Lasting non-violent disputes - i.e. non-violent political, economic, social etc. conflicts.
6. Minority incidents - i.e. individual occurrences, exceptional events, criminal activities that might involve violence but are not part of a continuous confrontation.
9. Other:

17. Topic of the item: minority policy

1. Government minority policy - i.e. general political initiatives regarding minority policy, new legal proposals, policy measures, their consequences, criticism, debate etc.
2. Minority civic/political representatives –advocating minority rights
3. International community – on minorities
4. Minority policies/issues in the neighborhood/Region
9. Other:

18. Topic of the item: everyday life

1. Exceptional achievement - i.e. "positive example" stories, individual positive examples within negative context.
2. Political, business, and social activities of the minority - i.e. inclusion of minority in the activities of the mainstream society.
3. Cultural activity - i.e. education, customs, rituals, tradition etc.
4. Criminal/ Incidents activity.
5. General background stories, history - i.e. stories about the past, historical cases of discrimination, or cooperation, general background analysis etc.
9. Other:

оби

19. Type of minority in question

- | | | |
|----------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| 1. Ethnic minorities | 5. Trafficking victims | 8. Minority in general |
| 2. Migrants | 6. LGBT | 9. Minority issue |
| 3. Refugee | 7. People with | |
| 4. Asylum seekers | disabilities. | |

20. Minority identification (ethnic Turks, Roma, lesbian, refugees from Syria, prostitute etc.)

21. Voice of the minority reported:

1. Yes
2. No
3. Through representative(s)

22. Minority voice(s) relation with majority/mainstream voices

1. Minority voice balanced
2. Minority voice dominates
3. Minority voice is insignificant
4. Minority voice is absent.

III. ABOUT THE ACTOR

23. Actor's social role:

- | | | |
|----------------------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------------------|
| 1. Vox populi,
man/woman on the
street | 4. State official | 10. Fighter, member of a
military group |
| 2. Ethnic issues/human
rights activist | 5. Expert | 11. Witness |
| 3. Politician | 6. Artist | 12. Collectivity, write: |
| | 7. Celebrity/show buzz | 13. Undefined |
| | 8. Criminal | 14. Other: |
| | 9. Sportsman/woman | |

24. Actor's gender

1. Female
2. Male
9. Other:

25. Generalization of actor' activity

1. As an individual case
2. As representative of a larger group
3. As typical for the whole minority group
4. As typical for minorities in general

26. Actor's contribution in the presentation of the event

1. Defining actor
2. Defined actor
3. Both defining and being defined

27. Actor's voice

1. Directly quoted
2. Paraphrased
3. Referred to but not quoted
9. Other:

28. Major attributes: (about actors activities) Write the exact words used to qualify the actor or, if possible, identify the stereotype or metaphor used to "explain" the actors behavior.

29. Framing of the story:

1. Diagnostic/descriptive
2. Prognostic (prefer assumptions to the direct testimony of the people involved in news stories)
3. Evaluative/interpretative
4. Mobilization
5. Discriminatory